

LANC & TULLY
ENGINEERING AND SURVEYING, P.C.

John J. O'Rourke, P.E., Principal
David E. Higgins, P.E., Principal
John Queenan, P.E., Principal

Rodney C. Knowlton, L.S., Principal
Jerry A. Woods, L.S., Principal

John D. Russo, P.E., Principal
John Lane, P.E., L.S.
Arthur R. Tully, P.E.

August 6, 2018

Mr. Michael Manzi
Highway Superintendent
City of Beacon City Hall
1 Municipal Plaza
Beacon, NY 12508

RE: Churchill Parking Lot & Park
City of Beacon
Award Recommendation

Dear Mr. Manzi:

A total of three (3) bid proposals were submitted and opened on July 30, 2018 for the **Churchill Parking Lot & Pocket Park** project. The three proposals were carefully reviewed; all multiplication between estimated quantities and unit prices checked; and addition of total prices checked against the total contract amount. All proposals submitted were complete. One of the submitted proposals was noted as having mathematical errors. The "total unit price" per each bid item did not include the material cost, which was broken out in the previous column. Although the total unit price was wrong, the total price per bid item was correct, as the Contractor multiplied the estimated quantity times the material cost and total unit cost, and then added the numbers together. Based upon review of this matter by the City Attorney, it was determined that this error was insufficient to articulate a case for rejecting the submitted bid.

The following tabulation shows the order from lowest bidder, the name of the bidder, and the total contract amount, along with the correct contract amount for those with errors. The engineer's estimate for the project was approximately \$396,292.00.

NAME OF BIDDER	TOTAL CONTRACT AMOUNT
Butler Construction Group Montgomery, NY	\$387,045.13
Clove Excavators, Inc. Poughkeepsie, NY	\$441,838.50
Ben Ciccone, Inc. Poughkeepsie, NY	\$476,732.75

The lowest bidder is Butler Construction Group, with the total base bid amount of \$387,045.13. Butler Construction Group has submitted information related to several other projects they have completed in the past. References supplied were called and checked to verify the work completed by the prospective low bidder and were found to be acceptable. In our opinion, Butler Construction Group should be considered the lowest responsible bidder based upon the submitted information and Chapter 53 of the City Code. Along with the bid, the contractor has submitted a Non-Collusive Bidding Certificate, and a Bid Bond.

It is our recommendation to the City Council to award the **Churchill Parking Lot & Pocket Park** project to Butler Construction Group.

If you have any questions, or need any further information, please do not hesitate to contact our office.

Very truly

LANC & TULLY, P.C.



John Russo, P.E.

Cc: Nick Ward-Willis, City Attorney